

Bristol City Council

Minutes of the Full Council

25 February 2020 at 2.00 pm



Members Present:-

Councillors: Mayor Marvin Rees, Peter Abraham, Donald Alexander, Lesley Alexander, Nicola Beech, Nicola Bowden-Jones, Harriet Bradley, Mark Bradshaw, Mark Brain, Charlie Bolton, Tom Brook, Fabian Breckels, Tony Carey, Craig Cheney, Barry Clark, Jos Clark, Stephen Clarke, Harriet Clough, Eleanor Combley, Asher Craig, Chris Davies, Mike Davies, Carla Denyer, Kye Dudd, Richard Eddy, Jude English, Martin Fodor, Helen Godwin, Paul Goggin, Geoff Gollop, John Goulandris, Fi Hance, Margaret Hickman, Claire Hiscott, Helen Holland, Gary Hopkins, Chris Jackson, Hibaq Jama, Carole Johnson, Steve Jones, Anna Keen, Tim Kent, Sultan Khan, Gill Kirk, Cleo Lake, Jeff Lovell, Brenda Massey, Matt Melias, Graham Morris, Anthony Negus, Paula O'Rourke, Steve Pearce, Celia Phipps, Ruth Pickersgill, Kevin Quartley, Jo Sergeant, Afzal Shah, Steve Smith, Paul Smith, Clive Stevens, Jerome Thomas, Mhairi Threlfall, Estella Tincknell, Jon Wellington, Mark Weston, Lucy Whittle, Chris Windows, Mark Wright and Rippington

Aldermen in Attendance:- J McLaren, A Massey, C Williams, S Williams

1. Welcome, Introductions and Safety Information

The Lord Mayor welcomed all attendees to the meeting, and made a safety announcement in relation to the fire/emergency evacuation procedure.

2. Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Radford.

3. Declarations of Interest

Councillor Kent declared that a member of his family had an Education Health Care Plan.
Councillor Brain declared that his brother was a consultant for Bristol City Council.
Councillor Stevens, Breckels, Threlfall and Brook all declared that their partners work for Bristol City Council.



4. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

On the motion of the Lord Mayor, seconded by Councillor Kent, it was

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting of the Full Council held on the 14th January 2020 be confirmed as correct record and signed by the Lord Mayor.

5. Lord Mayor's Business

Honorary Alderman Spud Murphy

The Lord Mayor informed Full Council of the recent death of former Bristol City Councillor and Honorary Alderman Albert Edward Murphy, known to many as Spud Murphy. Condolences were sent to his family and a minutes silence was observed.

The Lord Mayor's Chain of Office

The Lord Mayor informed Full Council of the theft of cash and civic ceremonial jewellery, including the Lord Mayor's chain of office. Anyone with information was encouraged to call 101 quoting reference number 5220044814.

6. Public Forum (Public Petitions and Written Statements)

Public petitions:

There were no public petitions received.

Public statements:

The Full Council received and noted the following statements:

	Name	Title
PS01	Greg Roynon	SEND Funding Crisis

7. Petitions Notified by Councillors

The Full Council received and noted the following petitions:

	Name	Title
CP01	Councillor Carey	Road and Pedestrian Safety in Birchwood Road, BS4, 24 signatures



8. Budget Report 2020-2021

The Full Council considered a report setting out the Mayor's 2020-21 budget recommendations.

The Lord Mayor drew members' attention to the budget procedure to be followed.

At this point, on the motion of the Lord Mayor, it was

RESOLVED:

That the relevant standing orders (policy and budget framework procedure rules) be suspended, noting that the procedure to be followed at this meeting is at variance with the Council's standing orders.

The Mayor moved the budget report.

Councillor Cheney, Deputy Mayor for Finance, Governance and Performance seconded the report.

Councillor Gollop raised a point of order (CPR13.12) drawing attention to a new item on the Cabinet agenda on 4th March, which could impact on the budget as proposed. He sought assurances from the Section 151 Officer and the Monitoring Officer that Full Council were able to proceed with a lawful budget, and those assurances were provided. Councillor Gollop reiterated his concerns, which were echoed by Councillor Hopkins on behalf of the Liberal Democrat Group. Their concerns were noted.

The leaders of each party group, Cllrs Hickman, Councillor Weston, Councillor Combley and Councillor Hopkins each responded to the budget proposals.

Councillor Negus raised a point of Personal Explanation (CPR13.13) requesting permission to respond to Councillor Hickman's comments within her speech. The Lord Mayor ruled that time had elapsed and the meeting would move on.

Councillor Gollop presented comments on behalf of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and Councillor Clarke on behalf of the Resources Scrutiny Commission.

The Mayor then responded to the points raised.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3.45pm and reconvened at 4.00pm

On the meeting being reconvened, the Full Council then (under section 5 of the procedure) considered and debated each of the proposed budget amendments, as follows:

Liberal Democrat Group Budget Amendment

Revenue - Youth Card for Bristol Buses, Bus Support, SEND Support, External Communications and Mayor's Office



Capital - SEND Schools, East Bristol Pool, Parks and Play Space, Community Infrastructure Levy and Capital Contingency

Councillor Kent moved amendment no. 1 (revenue and capital)

Councillor Carey seconded the amendment.

Following debate, upon being put to the vote, both elements of the amendment were **LOST**.

Vote 1 revenue – 31 members voting for the amendment, 36 against, with 1 abstention.

Vote 2 capital – 31 members voting for the amendment, 35 against, with 1 abstention.

Green Group Budget Amendment

Revenue – Upskilling Estates Staff, HRA Reserve, Workplace parking levy plan, Project Management - Regeneration

Capital - Community Infrastructure Levy, Cycling and Walking Projects, HRA Reserve, Retrofitting energy improvements, Congestion Charging, Reduce Capital Contingency, Highways Infrastructure, Climate Change Reserve, Transport Improvements

Councillor Denyer moved amendment no. 2 (revenue and capital)

Councillor Fodor seconded the amendment.

Councillor Shah raised a point of order (CPR13.12) to confirm that he referred to legal advice in his speech rather than officer advice. His comment was noted.

Following debate, upon being put to the vote, the amendment 'revenue' was **CARRIED**.

Vote 3 revenue – 55 members voting for the amendment, 13 against, with 0 abstention.

Upon being put to the vote, the amendment 'capital' was **LOST**.

Vote 4 carried – 11 members voting for the amendment, 49 against, with 8 abstentions.

Conservative Group Budget Amendment

Revenue - Mayor's Office, Brussels Office, Reduce PR and Consultation, Parking Charges at Blaise and Oldbury, Reduce bulky item collection charge.

Capital - Local Centre investment, Cribbs/Patchway Mitigations, Community Infrastructure Levy, Libraries Investment, Additional Parks capital spend, Use of Commercialisation Reserve, Use of Mayor's risk consultation reserve, Reduce spend on securing Bear Pit.

Councillor Goulandrakis moved amendment no. 3 (revenue and capital)

Councillor Steve Smith seconded the amendment.

Following debate, upon being put to the vote, both elements of the amendment was **LOST**.



Vote 5 revenue – 20 members voting for the amendment, 47 against, with 0 abstention.

Vote 6 capital – 20 members voting for the amendment, 47 against, with 0 abstention.

Labour Group Budget Amendment

Revenue - HRA Rent increase, HRA Capital Financing

Councillor Paul Smith moved amendment no. 4 (revenue)

Councillor Hickman seconded the amendment.

Following debate, upon being put to the vote, the amendment was **CARRIED**.

Vote 7 revenue – 46 members voting for the amendment, 20 against, with 2 abstentions.

At the conclusion of the Full Council's consideration of, and voting on the individual budget amendments, the Lord Mayor clarified (under section 7 of the procedure) that the following amendments had been CARRIED:

Green Group Amendment no.2a (revenue)

Labour Group Amendment no.4 (revenue)

Also under section 7 of the procedure, on the motion of the Lord Mayor, the Full Council noted the Section 151 Officer's statement regarding the robustness of the budget estimates.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 6.00pm and reconvened at 6.20pm

On the meeting being reconvened, there was then (under section 8 of the procedure) a general debate on the budget proposals.

At the conclusion of the debate, the Mayor responded to the debate and to the Full Council's earlier consideration of the budget amendments. The Mayor indicated at this point that he was minded to accept an amended budget i.e. incorporating the Green Group amendment (revenue) and the Labour Group amendment (revenue).

On the motion of the Lord Mayor, seconded by the Deputy Lord Mayor, the Full Council then RESOLVED that Full Council NOTED:

- a) **The report from the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board and Resources Scrutiny Commission.**
- b) **The budget consultation process that was followed and feedback as outlined in Section 17 and Appendix 6.**
- c) **The feedback provided by the Schools Forum to Council, for their consideration in making final decisions on the Schools Budget for 2020/21 as outlined in Section 9.**



- d) That the consultation feedback and equality impact assessments and relevance checks as set out in Appendix 7 and within the full reports for the ring fenced accounts (Dedicated Schools Grant and Housing Revenue Account), have been taken into consideration and has informed the final budget proposals.
- e) The comments of the Chief Finance Officer (s151 Officer) on the robustness of the Budget and adequacy of reserves as set out in Section 15.
- f) The delegation of authority to the Director of Finance after consultation with the Deputy Mayor, Cabinet Member for Finance, Governance and Performance and the Mayor, to make any necessary technical adjustments or adjustments to the figures upon receipt of the final Local Government Finance Settlement, and West of England Combined Authority Levy; with transfers to and or from reserves as appropriate.

RESOLVED that Full Council AGREED: (with 36 members voting in favour, 29 against and 3 abstentions)

- g) The Bristol City Council levels of Council Tax increase of 3.99%; which includes 2% precept to support Adult Social Care and noting the precepts of the Police and Crime Commissioner for Avon and Somerset and the Avon Fire Authority.
- h) The calculations for determining the Council Tax requirement for the year 2020/21 as outlined in Appendix 8 and in accordance with the Local Government Finance Act 1992.
- i) The Council's General Fund net revenue budget for the year 2020/21 as £395.7 million and expenditure allocations as set out in Appendix 1; subject to any budget amendments properly notified to and approved by the Council in line with the Constitution.
- j) The temporary movement in general reserves of up to £6.1 million (31%) to mitigate the forecasted 2019/20 year end emergent pressures in the People directorate as outlined in Section 5.
- k) The Council's capital budget (excluding the HRA) for the years 2020/21 - 2024/25, totalling £612.0 million as set out in paragraph 13 and detailed in Appendix 2.
- l) The proposed Treasury Management Strategy for 2020/21 in Appendix 4, incorporating the Minimum Revenue Provision policy and the prudential indicators and limits.
- m) The Strategy for the Flexible use of Capital Receipts as set out in Appendix 5.

RESOLVED that Full Council AGREED: (with 48 members voting in favour, 0 against, 0 abstentions)

- n) The distribution of the 2020/21 Dedicated Schools Grant (DSG) of £374.2 million as recommended by Cabinet and the Schools Forum and summarised in Section 9.

RESOLVED that Full Council AGREED: (with 47 members voting in favour, 18 against, 3 abstentions)

- o) The Gross HRA revenue budget for the year 2020/21 as £119.1 million



- p) No increase in Housing Rents for 2020/21 for existing tenants.
- q) The use of flexibility in the rent standard with effect from April 2020, for new tenants:
- up to 5% for Housing.
 - up to 10% for Supported Housing.
- r) Increase of 2.7% (CPI +1%) with effect from April 2020 for Garage Rents.
- s) Authorise the Executive Director of Growth and Regeneration to set Service Charge budgets in line with the anticipated cost of delivery.
- t) The HRA capital budget for the years 2020/21 – 2024/25 totalling £354.0 million as detailed in Appendix 2 and including the following for 2020/21:
- £33.0 million capital expenditure on existing stock.
 - £40.8 million on the Development Programme.
 - £5.0 million on improvements to Sandy Park site subject to Business Case approval.
 - £0.9 million for other capital projects including the ICT project.

Meeting ended at 6.50 pm

CHAIR _____

Amendment No.1 - Liberal Democrat (a) revenue (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	Against
Councillor Peter Abraham	For
Councillor Donald Alexander	Against
Councillor Lesley Alexander	For
Councillor Nicola Beech	Against
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	Against
Councillor Harriet Bradley	Against
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	Against
Councillor Mark Brain	Against
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For
Councillor Tom Brook	Against
Councillor Fabian Breckels	Against
Councillor Tony Carey	For



Councillor Craig Cheney	Against
Councillor Barry Clark	Against
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	For
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	Against
Councillor Christopher Davies	For
Councillor Mike Davies	Against
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	Against
Councillor Richard Eddy	For
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	Against
Councillor Paul Goggin	Against
Councillor Geoff Gollop	For
Councillor John Goulandris	For
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	Against
Councillor Claire Hiscott	For
Councillor Helen Holland	Against
Councillor Gary Hopkins	For
Councillor Christopher Jackson	Against
Councillor Hibaq Jama	Against
Councillor Carole Johnson	Against
Councillor Steve Jones	For
Councillor Anna Keen	Against
Councillor Tim Kent	For
Councillor Sultan Khan	For
Councillor Gill Kirk	Against
Councillor Cleo Lake	Abstain
Councillor Jeff Lovell	Against
Councillor Brenda Massey	Against
Councillor Matthew Melias	For
Councillor Graham Morris	For
Councillor Anthony Negus	For
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	Against
Councillor Celia Phipps	Against
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	Against
Councillor Kevin Quartley	For
Councillor Jo Sergeant	Against



Councillor Afzal Shah	Against
Councillor Steve Smith	For
Councillor Paul Smith	Against
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	Against
Councillor Estella Tincknell	Against
Councillor Jon Wellington	Against
Councillor Mark Weston	For
Councillor Lucy Whittle	Against
Councillor Chris Windows	For
Councillor Mark Wright	For
Rejected	
Amendment No.1 - Liberal Democrat (b) capital (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	Against
Councillor Peter Abraham	For
Councillor Donald Alexander	Against
Councillor Lesley Alexander	For
Councillor Nicola Beech	Against
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	Against
Councillor Harriet Bradley	Against
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	Against
Councillor Mark Brain	Against
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For
Councillor Tom Brook	Against
Councillor Fabian Breckels	Against
Councillor Tony Carey	For
Councillor Craig Cheney	Against
Councillor Barry Clark	Against
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	For
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	Against
Councillor Christopher Davies	For
Councillor Mike Davies	Against
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	No vote recorded
Councillor Richard Eddy	For
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	Against



Councillor Paul Goggin	Against
Councillor Geoff Gollop	For
Councillor John Goulandris	For
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	Against
Councillor Claire Hiscott	For
Councillor Helen Holland	Against
Councillor Gary Hopkins	For
Councillor Christopher Jackson	Against
Councillor Hibaq Jama	Against
Councillor Carole Johnson	Against
Councillor Steve Jones	For
Councillor Anna Keen	Against
Councillor Tim Kent	For
Councillor Sultan Khan	For
Councillor Gill Kirk	Against
Councillor Cleo Lake	Abstain
Councillor Jeff Lovell	Against
Councillor Brenda Massey	Against
Councillor Matthew Melias	For
Councillor Graham Morris	For
Councillor Anthony Negus	For
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	Against
Councillor Celia Phipps	Against
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	Against
Councillor Kevin Quartley	For
Councillor Jo Sergeant	Against
Councillor Afzal Shah	Against
Councillor Steve Smith	For
Councillor Paul Smith	Against
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	Against
Councillor Estella Tincknell	Against
Councillor Jon Wellington	Against
Councillor Mark Weston	For
Councillor Lucy Whittle	Against
Councillor Chris Windows	For
Councillor Mark Wright	For
Rejected	



Amendment No.2 - Green (a) revenue (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	For
Councillor Peter Abraham	Against
Councillor Donald Alexander	For
Councillor Lesley Alexander	Against
Councillor Nicola Beech	For
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	For
Councillor Harriet Bradley	For
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	For
Councillor Mark Brain	For
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For
Councillor Tom Brook	For
Councillor Fabian Breckels	For
Councillor Tony Carey	For
Councillor Craig Cheney	For
Councillor Barry Clark	For
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	For
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	For
Councillor Christopher Davies	For
Councillor Mike Davies	For
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	For
Councillor Richard Eddy	Against
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	For
Councillor Paul Goggin	For
Councillor Geoff Gollop	Against
Councillor John Goulandris	Against
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	For
Councillor Claire Hiscott	Against
Councillor Helen Holland	For
Councillor Gary Hopkins	For
Councillor Christopher Jackson	For
Councillor Hibaq Jama	For
Councillor Carole Johnson	For
Councillor Steve Jones	Against
Councillor Anna Keen	For
Councillor Tim Kent	For



Councillor Sultan Khan	For
Councillor Gill Kirk	For
Councillor Cleo Lake	For
Councillor Jeff Lovell	For
Councillor Brenda Massey	For
Councillor Matthew Melias	Against
Councillor Graham Morris	Against
Councillor Anthony Negus	For
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	For
Councillor Celia Phipps	For
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	For
Councillor Kevin Quartley	Against
Councillor Jo Sergeant	For
Councillor Afzal Shah	For
Councillor Steve Smith	Against
Councillor Paul Smith	For
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	For
Councillor Estella Tincknell	For
Councillor Jon Wellington	For
Councillor Mark Weston	Against
Councillor Lucy Whittle	For
Councillor Chris Windows	Against
Councillor Mark Wright	For
Carried	
Amendment No.2 - Green (b) capital (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	Against
Councillor Peter Abraham	Against
Councillor Donald Alexander	Against
Councillor Lesley Alexander	Against
Councillor Nicola Beech	Against
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	Against
Councillor Harriet Bradley	Against
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	Against
Councillor Mark Brain	Against
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For
Councillor Tom Brook	Against
Councillor Fabian Breckels	Against
Councillor Tony Carey	Abstain



Councillor Craig Cheney	Against
Councillor Barry Clark	Against
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	Abstain
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	Against
Councillor Christopher Davies	Abstain
Councillor Mike Davies	Against
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	Against
Councillor Richard Eddy	Against
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	Against
Councillor Paul Goggin	Against
Councillor Geoff Gollop	Against
Councillor John Goulandris	Against
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	Against
Councillor Claire Hiscott	Against
Councillor Helen Holland	Against
Councillor Gary Hopkins	Abstain
Councillor Christopher Jackson	Against
Councillor Hibaq Jama	Against
Councillor Carole Johnson	Against
Councillor Steve Jones	Against
Councillor Anna Keen	Against
Councillor Tim Kent	Abstain
Councillor Sultan Khan	Abstain
Councillor Gill Kirk	Against
Councillor Cleo Lake	For
Councillor Jeff Lovell	Against
Councillor Brenda Massey	Against
Councillor Matthew Melias	Against
Councillor Graham Morris	Against
Councillor Anthony Negus	Abstain
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	Against
Councillor Celia Phipps	Against
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	Against
Councillor Kevin Quartley	Against
Councillor Jo Sergeant	Against



Councillor Afzal Shah	Against
Councillor Steve Smith	Against
Councillor Paul Smith	Against
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	Against
Councillor Estella Tincknell	Against
Councillor Jon Wellington	Against
Councillor Mark Weston	Against
Councillor Lucy Whittle	Against
Councillor Chris Windows	Against
Councillor Mark Wright	Abstain
Rejected	
Amendment No.3 - Conservative (a) revenue (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	Against
Councillor Peter Abraham	For
Councillor Donald Alexander	Against
Councillor Lesley Alexander	For
Councillor Nicola Beech	Against
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	Against
Councillor Harriet Bradley	Against
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	Against
Councillor Mark Brain	Against
Councillor Charlie Bolton	Against
Councillor Tom Brook	Against
Councillor Fabian Breckels	Against
Councillor Tony Carey	For
Councillor Craig Cheney	Against
Councillor Barry Clark	Against
Councillor Stephen Clarke	Against
Councillor Harriet Clough	No vote recorded
Councillor Eleanor Combley	Against
Councillor Asher Craig	Against
Councillor Christopher Davies	For
Councillor Mike Davies	Against
Councillor Carla Denyer	Against
Councillor Kye Dudd	Against
Councillor Richard Eddy	For
Councillor Jude English	Against
Councillor Martin Fodor	Against
Councillor Helen Godwin	Against



Councillor Paul Goggin	Against
Councillor Geoff Gollop	For
Councillor John Goulandris	For
Councillor Fi Hance	Against
Councillor Margaret Hickman	Against
Councillor Claire Hiscott	For
Councillor Helen Holland	Against
Councillor Gary Hopkins	For
Councillor Christopher Jackson	Against
Councillor Hibaq Jama	Against
Councillor Carole Johnson	Against
Councillor Steve Jones	For
Councillor Anna Keen	Against
Councillor Tim Kent	For
Councillor Sultan Khan	For
Councillor Gill Kirk	Against
Councillor Cleo Lake	Against
Councillor Jeff Lovell	Against
Councillor Brenda Massey	Against
Councillor Matthew Melias	For
Councillor Graham Morris	For
Councillor Anthony Negus	For
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	Against
Councillor Steve Pearce	Against
Councillor Celia Phipps	Against
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	Against
Councillor Kevin Quartley	For
Councillor Jo Sergeant	Against
Councillor Afzal Shah	Against
Councillor Steve Smith	For
Councillor Paul Smith	Against
Councillor Clive Stevens	Against
Councillor Jerome Thomas	Against
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	Against
Councillor Estella Tincknell	Against
Councillor Jon Wellington	Against
Councillor Mark Weston	For
Councillor Lucy Whittle	Against
Councillor Chris Windows	For
Councillor Mark Wright	For
Rejected	



Amendment No.3 - Conservative (b) capital (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	Against
Councillor Peter Abraham	For
Councillor Donald Alexander	Against
Councillor Lesley Alexander	For
Councillor Nicola Beech	Against
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	Against
Councillor Harriet Bradley	Against
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	Against
Councillor Mark Brain	Against
Councillor Charlie Bolton	Against
Councillor Tom Brook	Against
Councillor Fabian Breckels	Against
Councillor Tony Carey	For
Councillor Craig Cheney	Against
Councillor Barry Clark	Against
Councillor Stephen Clarke	Against
Councillor Harriet Clough	No vote recorded
Councillor Eleanor Combley	Against
Councillor Asher Craig	Against
Councillor Christopher Davies	For
Councillor Mike Davies	Against
Councillor Carla Denyer	Against
Councillor Kye Dudd	Against
Councillor Richard Eddy	For
Councillor Jude English	Against
Councillor Martin Fodor	Against
Councillor Helen Godwin	Against
Councillor Paul Goggin	Against
Councillor Geoff Gollop	For
Councillor John Goulandris	For
Councillor Fi Hance	Against
Councillor Margaret Hickman	Against
Councillor Claire Hiscott	For
Councillor Helen Holland	Against
Councillor Gary Hopkins	For
Councillor Christopher Jackson	Against
Councillor Hibaq Jama	Against
Councillor Carole Johnson	Against
Councillor Steve Jones	For
Councillor Anna Keen	Against
Councillor Tim Kent	For



Councillor Sultan Khan	For
Councillor Gill Kirk	Against
Councillor Cleo Lake	Against
Councillor Jeff Lovell	Against
Councillor Brenda Massey	Against
Councillor Matthew Melias	For
Councillor Graham Morris	For
Councillor Anthony Negus	For
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	Against
Councillor Steve Pearce	Against
Councillor Celia Phipps	Against
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	Against
Councillor Kevin Quartley	For
Councillor Jo Sergeant	Against
Councillor Afzal Shah	Against
Councillor Steve Smith	For
Councillor Paul Smith	Against
Councillor Clive Stevens	Against
Councillor Jerome Thomas	Against
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	Against
Councillor Estella Tincknell	Against
Councillor Jon Wellington	Against
Councillor Mark Weston	For
Councillor Lucy Whittle	Against
Councillor Chris Windows	For
Councillor Mark Wright	For
Rejected	
Amendment No.4 - Labour (a) revenue (Amendment)	
Marvin Rees	For
Councillor Peter Abraham	Against
Councillor Donald Alexander	For
Councillor Lesley Alexander	Against
Councillor Nicola Beech	For
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	For
Councillor Harriet Bradley	For
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	For
Councillor Mark Brain	For
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For
Councillor Tom Brook	For
Councillor Fabian Breckels	For
Councillor Tony Carey	Abstain



Councillor Craig Cheney	For
Councillor Barry Clark	Against
Councillor Jos Clark	No vote recorded
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	Against
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	For
Councillor Christopher Davies	Against
Councillor Mike Davies	For
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	For
Councillor Richard Eddy	Against
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	For
Councillor Paul Goggin	For
Councillor Geoff Gollop	Against
Councillor John Goulandris	Against
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	For
Councillor Claire Hiscott	Against
Councillor Helen Holland	For
Councillor Gary Hopkins	Against
Councillor Christopher Jackson	For
Councillor Hibaq Jama	For
Councillor Carole Johnson	For
Councillor Steve Jones	Against
Councillor Anna Keen	For
Councillor Tim Kent	Against
Councillor Sultan Khan	Against
Councillor Gill Kirk	For
Councillor Cleo Lake	For
Councillor Jeff Lovell	For
Councillor Brenda Massey	For
Councillor Matthew Melias	Against
Councillor Graham Morris	Against
Councillor Anthony Negus	Abstain
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	For
Councillor Celia Phipps	For
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	For
Councillor Kevin Quartley	Against



Councillor Jo Sergeant	For
Councillor Afzal Shah	For
Councillor Steve Smith	Against
Councillor Paul Smith	For
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	For
Councillor Estella Tincknell	For
Councillor Jon Wellington	For
Councillor Mark Weston	Against
Councillor Lucy Whittle	For
Councillor Chris Windows	Against
Councillor Mark Wright	Against
Carried	
Vote One - g), h), i), j), k), l), m) (Resolution)	
Marvin Rees	For
Councillor Peter Abraham	Against
Councillor Donald Alexander	For
Councillor Lesley Alexander	Against
Councillor Nicola Beech	For
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	For
Councillor Harriet Bradley	For
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	For
Councillor Mark Brain	For
Councillor Charlie Bolton	Abstain
Councillor Tom Brook	For
Councillor Fabian Breckels	For
Councillor Tony Carey	Against
Councillor Craig Cheney	For
Councillor Barry Clark	For
Councillor Jos Clark	No vote recorded
Councillor Stephen Clarke	Against
Councillor Harriet Clough	Against
Councillor Eleanor Combley	Against
Councillor Asher Craig	For
Councillor Christopher Davies	Against
Councillor Mike Davies	For
Councillor Carla Denyer	Against
Councillor Kye Dudd	For
Councillor Richard Eddy	Against
Councillor Jude English	Against



Councillor Martin Fodor	Against
Councillor Helen Godwin	For
Councillor Paul Goggin	For
Councillor Geoff Gollop	Against
Councillor John Goulandris	Against
Councillor Fi Hance	Against
Councillor Margaret Hickman	For
Councillor Claire Hiscott	Against
Councillor Helen Holland	For
Councillor Gary Hopkins	Against
Councillor Christopher Jackson	For
Councillor Hibaq Jama	For
Councillor Carole Johnson	For
Councillor Steve Jones	Against
Councillor Anna Keen	For
Councillor Tim Kent	Against
Councillor Sultan Khan	Against
Councillor Gill Kirk	For
Councillor Cleo Lake	Abstain
Councillor Jeff Lovell	For
Councillor Brenda Massey	For
Councillor Matthew Melias	Against
Councillor Graham Morris	Against
Councillor Anthony Negus	Against
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	Abstain
Councillor Steve Pearce	For
Councillor Celia Phipps	For
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	For
Councillor Kevin Quartley	Against
Councillor Jo Sergeant	For
Councillor Afzal Shah	For
Councillor Steve Smith	Against
Councillor Paul Smith	For
Councillor Clive Stevens	Against
Councillor Jerome Thomas	Against
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	For
Councillor Estella Tincknell	For
Councillor Jon Wellington	For
Councillor Mark Weston	Against
Councillor Lucy Whittle	For
Councillor Chris Windows	Against
Councillor Mark Wright	Against



Carried	
Vote Two - n) (Resolution)	
Marvin Rees	For
Councillor Peter Abraham	For
Councillor Donald Alexander	For
Councillor Lesley Alexander	For
Councillor Nicola Beech	For
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	For
Councillor Harriet Bradley	For
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	For
Councillor Mark Brain	For
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For
Councillor Tom Brook	For
Councillor Fabian Breckels	For
Councillor Tony Carey	For
Councillor Craig Cheney	For
Councillor Barry Clark	For
Councillor Jos Clark	No vote recorded
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	For
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	For
Councillor Christopher Davies	For
Councillor Mike Davies	For
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	For
Councillor Richard Eddy	For
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	For
Councillor Paul Goggin	For
Councillor Geoff Gollop	For
Councillor John Goulandris	For
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	For
Councillor Claire Hiscott	For
Councillor Helen Holland	For
Councillor Gary Hopkins	For
Councillor Christopher Jackson	For
Councillor Hibaq Jama	For
Councillor Carole Johnson	For



Councillor Steve Jones	For
Councillor Anna Keen	For
Councillor Tim Kent	For
Councillor Sultan Khan	For
Councillor Gill Kirk	For
Councillor Cleo Lake	For
Councillor Jeff Lovell	For
Councillor Brenda Massey	For
Councillor Matthew Melias	For
Councillor Graham Morris	For
Councillor Anthony Negus	For
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	For
Councillor Celia Phipps	For
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	For
Councillor Kevin Quartley	For
Councillor Jo Sergeant	For
Councillor Afzal Shah	For
Councillor Steve Smith	For
Councillor Paul Smith	For
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	For
Councillor Estella Tincknell	For
Councillor Jon Wellington	For
Councillor Mark Weston	For
Councillor Lucy Whittle	For
Councillor Chris Windows	For
Councillor Mark Wright	For
Carried	
Vote Three - o), p), q), r), s), t) (Resolution)	
Marvin Rees	For
Councillor Peter Abraham	Against
Councillor Donald Alexander	For
Councillor Lesley Alexander	Against
Councillor Nicola Beech	For
Councillor Nicola Bowden-Jones	For
Councillor Harriet Bradley	For
Councillor Mark Bradshaw	For
Councillor Mark Brain	For
Councillor Charlie Bolton	For



Councillor Tom Brook	For
Councillor Fabian Breckels	For
Councillor Tony Carey	Abstain
Councillor Craig Cheney	For
Councillor Barry Clark	For
Councillor Jos Clark	No vote recorded
Councillor Stephen Clarke	For
Councillor Harriet Clough	Against
Councillor Eleanor Combley	For
Councillor Asher Craig	For
Councillor Christopher Davies	Against
Councillor Mike Davies	For
Councillor Carla Denyer	For
Councillor Kye Dudd	For
Councillor Richard Eddy	Against
Councillor Jude English	For
Councillor Martin Fodor	For
Councillor Helen Godwin	For
Councillor Paul Goggin	For
Councillor Geoff Gollop	Against
Councillor John Goulandris	Against
Councillor Fi Hance	For
Councillor Margaret Hickman	For
Councillor Claire Hiscott	Against
Councillor Helen Holland	For
Councillor Gary Hopkins	Against
Councillor Christopher Jackson	For
Councillor Hibaq Jama	For
Councillor Carole Johnson	For
Councillor Steve Jones	Against
Councillor Anna Keen	For
Councillor Tim Kent	Against
Councillor Sultan Khan	Abstain
Councillor Gill Kirk	For
Councillor Cleo Lake	For
Councillor Jeff Lovell	For
Councillor Brenda Massey	For
Councillor Matthew Melias	Against
Councillor Graham Morris	Against
Councillor Anthony Negus	Abstain
Councillor Paula O'Rourke	For
Councillor Steve Pearce	For



Councillor Celia Phipps	For
Councillor Ruth Pickersgill	For
Councillor Kevin Quartley	Against
Councillor Jo Sergeant	For
Councillor Afzal Shah	For
Councillor Steve Smith	Against
Councillor Paul Smith	For
Councillor Clive Stevens	For
Councillor Jerome Thomas	For
Councillor Mhairi Threlfall	For
Councillor Estella Tincknell	For
Councillor Jon Wellington	For
Councillor Mark Weston	Against
Councillor Lucy Whittle	For
Councillor Chris Windows	Against
Councillor Mark Wright	Against
Carried	

