



1st November 2017 at 6pm

DISCLAIMER

The attached Minutes are DRAFT. Whilst every effort has been made to ensure the accuracy of the information and statements and decisions recorded in them, their status will remain that of a draft until such time as they are confirmed as a correct record at the subsequent meeting

Members Present;

Councillors Don Alexander, Charlie Bolton, Tom Brook, Harriet Bradley (substituting for Cllr Kirk), Jos Clark (partial substitution for Cllr Negus), Jude English, Geoff Gollop (in the Chair), John Goulandris, Anna Keen, Anthony Negus and Estella Tincknell

Also in attendance in part;

Councillor Asher Craig, Deputy Mayor and Cabinet Member for Communities, Events and Equalities
Councillor Fi Hance, Cabinet Member for Energy, Waste and Regulatory Services
Councillor Helen Holland, Cabinet Member for Adult Social Care

Officers in Attendance;

Denise Murray - Service Director, Finance; Nancy Rollason - Head of Legal Services; Andrea Dell - Head of Democratic Engagement; Lucy Fleming – Democratic and Scrutiny Manager; and Tim Borrett – Head of Policy and Strategy (interim).

1. Welcome, Introductions and Safety Information

The Chair welcomed all those in attendance.

2. Apologies for Absence;

Apologies for absence were noted from Councillor Kirk.

3. Declarations of Interest;

There were no declarations of interest.



4. Minutes of the Previous Meetings;

The minutes of the meetings on 25th July 17, 31st August 17 and 20th September 17 were agreed to be a correct record subject to;

- 25th July 17;
That Councillor Brenda Massey be added to the list of attendees.
 - 31st August 17;
That the references to Councillor Massey's and Councillor Champion Smith's chairing roles on pages 22 and 186 of the papers be amended i.e.;
- Reducing demand on social care (adults) – should read Councillor Champion Smith not Councillor Massey; and
 - Reducing demand on social care (adults) – should read Councillor Massey not Councillor Champion Smith

RESOLVED; That the minutes of the meetings on 25th July 17, 31st August 17 and 20th September 17 be approved as a correct record, subject to the amendments detailed above.

5. Chair's Business

The Chair, Councillor Gollop, confirmed that the Mayor's Question Time session due to take place immediately before the meeting had been cancelled due to a miscommunication. Members agreed that the Mayor would be asked to attend their next meeting on 7th December 17 for an informal discussion or if not then an alternative slot would be arranged as soon as possible thereafter.

RESOLVED; That the cancelled Mayor's Question Time session of 1st November 17 be replaced with an informal discussion either to take place on 7th December 17 or at an alternative mutually convenient time.

6. Public Forum

Members received the following public forum statements, a copy of which can be found in the minute book;

Name	Subject
1. Allyn Condon	Justice for Benjamin Condon
2. Ann Doran (Mrs)	Justice for Benjamin Condon
3. Marian Minnis	Justice for Benjamin Condon
4. Varinderjit (Vic) Singh	Justice for Benjamin Condon
5. Allyn Condon	Justice for Benjamin Condon
6. Ron Odunaiya	Justice for Benjamin Condon
7. Yolanda and Steve Turner	Justice for Benjamin Condon



8. Jane Dickinson	Justice for Benjamin Condon
9. Carolyn Boyce	Justice for Benjamin Condon
10. Sarah Smerdon	Justice for Benjamin Condon
11. Victoria Willis	Justice for Benjamin Condon
12. Justine Condon-Hickey	Justice for Benjamin Condon
13. Carl Dickinson	Justice for Benjamin Condon
14. Simon Creese	Justice for Benjamin Condon
15. Anna Taylor (Mrs)	Justice for Benjamin Condon
16. Carolyn Smith	Justice for Benjamin Condon
17. David McKeown	Justice for Benjamin Condon
18. Jackie Costello	Justice for Benjamin Condon
19. Geraldine Mcleod-Pratt	Justice for Benjamin Condon
20. Alan Mccarthy	Justice for Benjamin Condon
21. Saskia Blackwell	Justice for Benjamin Condon
22. Steven Mottram	Justice for Benjamin Condon
23. Bobby Lockwood	Justice for Benjamin Condon
24. Kieran McCullough	Justice for Benjamin Condon
25. Patrick O'Hare (Prof)	Justice for Benjamin Condon
26. Sandi Owen	Justice for Benjamin Condon
27. Jonathan Wooldridge	Justice for Benjamin Condon
28. Beverly Houghton (Mrs)	Justice for Benjamin Condon
29. Gillian	Justice for Benjamin Condon
30. Danielle Hardaway	Justice for Benjamin Condon
31. Richard Whitmarsh	Justice for Benjamin Condon
32. Alistair Morgan	Justice for Benjamin Condon
33. Will Morgan	Justice for Benjamin Condon
34. Marc Steele	Justice for Benjamin Condon
35. Victoria Willis	Justice for Benjamin Condon
36. Jenny Mccarthy	Justice for Benjamin Condon
37. Erik Molnar	Justice for Benjamin Condon
38. Kevan Furber	Justice for Benjamin Condon
39. Sue Furber	Justice for Benjamin Condon
40. Jo McCullough	Justice for Benjamin Condon
41. Deborah Nicholas	Justice for Benjamin Condon
42. Morris Condon	Justice for Benjamin Condon
43. Margret Condon	Justice for Benjamin Condon
44. Martin Cooper	Justice for Benjamin Condon
45. Louis Evison	Justice for Benjamin Condon
46. Jennifer Devlin	Justice for Benjamin Condon
47. Laura Hartnell	Justice for Benjamin Condon
48. Kathryn Binks	Justice for Benjamin Condon
49. Toby Box	Justice for Benjamin Condon



50. Danny Clowes	Justice for Benjamin Condon
51. Franny Curlett	Justice for Benjamin Condon
52. Jo McCullough	Justice for Benjamin Condon
53. Jamie Coe	Justice for Benjamin Condon
54. Carl Disckinson	Justice for Benjamin Condon
55. Zoe Sloman	Justice for Benjamin Condon
56. Ryan Edwards	Justice for Benjamin Condon
57. Simon Creese	Justice for Benjamin Condon
58. Peter Annesley	Justice for Benjamin Condon
59. Tess Murphy	Justice for Benjamin Condon
60. Pat Hargreaves	Justice for Benjamin Condon
61. Kevin Hargreaves	Justice for Benjamin Condon
62. Dave Archer	Justice for Benjamin Condon
63. Matt Fearon	Justice for Benjamin Condon
64. John Foy	Justice for Benjamin Condon
65. Lloyd Rice	Justice for Benjamin Condon
66. John Scotland	Justice for Benjamin Condon
67. Paul Spearritt	Justice for Benjamin Condon
68. Leon Edwards	Justice for Benjamin Condon
69. Adele Edwards	Justice for Benjamin Condon
70. Stephen Cheetman	Justice for Benjamin Condon
71. Bekah Murphy	Justice for Benjamin Condon
72. Leah Hatfield	Justice for Benjamin Condon
73. Lisa Ahearne-Griffith	Justice for Benjamin Condon
74. Sharon Cosgrove	Justice for Benjamin Condon
75. Martin Cooper	Justice for Benjamin Condon
76. Chris Hulme	Justice for Benjamin Condon
77. Gillian Lynch	Justice for Benjamin Condon
78. Jodie Bennett	Justice for Benjamin Condon
79. John Longstaff	Justice for Benjamin Condon
80. Brendan Reilly	Justice for Benjamin Condon
81. Graham Richardson	Justice for Benjamin Condon
82. Adam Kemp	Justice for Benjamin Condon
83. Jonathan Hartnell	Justice for Benjamin Condon
84. Ben Edwards-Inatimi	Justice for Benjamin Condon
85. Michelle Thomas	Justice for Benjamin Condon
86. Iain Mac	Justice for Benjamin Condon
87. Suzann Sergeant	Justice for Benjamin Condon
88. Lisa Ramsey	Justice for Benjamin Condon
89. Sherroll Martin	Justice for Benjamin Condon
90. G Rutherford-Spence	Justice for Benjamin Condon
91. Derek Robinson	Justice for Benjamin Condon



92. Phil Rotheram	Justice for Benjamin Condon
93. Paula Jackson	Justice for Benjamin Condon
94. Kathryn Unsworth	Justice for Benjamin Condon
95. Joan Mccarthy	Justice for Benjamin Condon
96. Abbey Lyons	Justice for Benjamin Condon
97. Nicola Rotheram	Justice for Benjamin Condon
98. Ben James	Justice for Benjamin Condon
99. Neil Gregory	Justice for Benjamin Condon
100. Carley Wilson	Justice for Benjamin Condon
101. Kie Norton	Justice for Benjamin Condon
102. David Forrest	Justice for Benjamin Condon
103. Luke Hargreaves	Justice for Benjamin Condon
104. Susan Moncrieff	Justice for Benjamin Condon
105. Lisa Davies	Justice for Benjamin Condon
106. Denni Fisher	Justice for Benjamin Condon
107. Danielle Syla	Justice for Benjamin Condon
108. Catherine Guttridge	Justice for Benjamin Condon
109. Mr S Brew	Justice for Benjamin Condon
110. Fiona Atherton	Justice for Benjamin Condon
111. Margaret O'Connor	Justice for Benjamin Condon
112. Ian Rathbone	Justice for Benjamin Condon
113. Geoff Dearman	Justice for Benjamin Condon
114. Rob Alderman	Justice for Benjamin Condon
115. Mel Harris	Justice for Benjamin Condon
116. David Redgewell	Travel
117. David Redgewell	WECA
118. Daphne Havercroft	Health Scrutiny
119. Jane Carter	Libraries Task and Finish
120. Julie Boston	Young People
121. Members of JHOSC Health	Health Scrutiny

The following matters were discussed;

Justice for Benjamin Condon

Members noted the large number of statements relating to the Benjamin Condon case, which had last been considered by Bristol Scrutiny at a meeting in common with South Gloucestershire Council in February 2016. Papers can be found here; [Meeting in Common](#)

At the meeting in common Members agreed to hold a further session in around a year in order to review whether various improvements to procedures at the Bristol Hospital for Children had been made. Members noted that there had been significant new developments in this case since the Chief



Executive of University Hospitals Bristol NHS Foundation Trust had recently publically apologised to the parents of Benjamin Condon stating, 'we failed to take the opportunity to give Ben timely antibiotics and this contributed to his death.' In view of this, Members agreed that it would be appropriate to bring forward the second meeting in common to a new date as soon as possible, with an update of the outcomes to be provided to OSM as soon as possible thereafter, and officers were asked to liaise with South Gloucestershire Council to see if they were in agreement. The Board requested that all of the public forum statements be carried over.

The Chair went on to make specific reference to the concerns raised in the statement from Mr Allyn Condon which suggested that Members serving on Bristol Scrutiny had potential conflicts of interest. Councillor Gollop advised that Members had a duty to declare any interests and therefore they would not have sat if they were unable to do so objectively. He requested that formal confirmation of this be sent to Mr Condon in advance of the second meeting in common.

Travel

Members noted the statement from Mr David Redgewell highlighting concerns about disabled access to the temporary bus stops in the vicinity of Temple Meads Station. The Board confirmed that they were familiar with the site so did not feel the need to arrange the site visit, as suggested, however it was agreed that the Director of Transport would be asked to respond.

Health Scrutiny

The Board noted the suggestion that the Bristol Members of the Joint Health and Overview Scrutiny Commission become a new standing Health Scrutiny Commission. It was agreed that the matter would be discussed further at a meeting of the party leads, who would report back in due course.

RESOLVED;

That South Gloucestershire Council be asked to bring forward the next 'meeting in common' to a date as soon as possible to review changes at Bristol Hospital for Children following the Benjamin Condon case, with an update on the outcomes to be provided to OSM thereafter; and

That all of the statements received in relation to Benjamin Condon be carried over to the additional meeting in common; and

That a formal reply be sent to Mr Condon confirming that Members had a duty to declare any interests and therefore would not have sat at the meeting in common if they were unable to do so objectively; and

That a written reply be provided to Mr David Redgewell following his concerns about disabled access at the temporary bus stops around Temple Meads Station; and



That the party leads be asked to consider the suggestion that a new standing Health Scrutiny Commission be established, formed of the Bristol Members who currently sat on the Joint Health and Overview Scrutiny Commission, and report back in due course.

7. Flood Risk Strategy

Members received a presentation setting out the Flood Risk Strategy for 2017/18, a copy of which is appended to these minutes at appendix A.

The Board considered the information provided and asked for additional details in a number of areas. The salient points were as follows;

- The report before Members was to provide an overarching update on the strategy for the city and did not include specific reference to potential projects that were being considered.
- The possibility of installing a tidal barrage as part of Bristol's flood defences was still being explored and an update would be provided to Members at the appropriate juncture.
- The flood risk measures recently adopted in Southmead were working well. Members were encouraged to continue to report local issues.
- A flood risk study for Ashton was underway and Members would be provided with details in due course.
- A strategy for flooding in relation to the River Avon was planned; funding from DEFRA was being sought to deliver preventative measures.
- Flood risk was a serious concern for Members. It was agreed that it would be added to the list of potential topics for a future Scrutiny Task and Finish Group.

RESOLVED;

That the report be noted and further updates be provided in due course.

8. Libraries Task and Finish Group Report

The report was introduced by Councillor Negus, Chair of the Libraries Task and Finish Group, and Members went on to consider the recommendations and next steps. The following matters were discussed;

- The Task and Finish Group accepted that reductions to the budgets for the library service has been agreed but believed there were alternative options that would minimise the number of closures that should be considered by the Cabinet but it was unlikely that all 17 threatened libraries would be saved. Members did agree that in some communities libraries were so



underutilised that they regretfully could not continue to be supported at a time of significant financial pressures.

- The findings of the report were unanimously supported by the Board, but concerns were raised by a Member regarding the viability of implementing mutuals/trusts etc. due to the Council's diminishing resource and if the plans set out in the report were progressed but failed, the library service could be left in a worse position.
- The Cabinet Member for Communities, Events and Equalities confirmed that she welcomed the report and would provide a written reply to the recommendations in advance of the Cabinet meeting on 4th December 2017.
- The Board asked that a vote of thanks be recorded to all of the Members and officers who worked on the Libraries Task and Finish Group, noting that a high quality report had been produced within a very short timescale.

RESOLVED;

That the report be endorsed and submitted to Cabinet for consideration at the meeting on 4th December 17, alongside an extract minute setting out the accompanying comments.

9. Scrutiny of the Budget

The Board discussed the proposed plan for Scrutiny of the City Council's budget for 18/19 which had been prepared in conjunction with the Medium Financial Plan Task and Finish Group, with support from officers. The following points were made;

- The Overview and Scrutiny Management Board would consider the budget at meetings in January 18 and the Cabinet Members would be invited to attend and participate in the discussion.
- The response rates for City Council consultations were often not very high (last year's budget consultation was completed by 1100 people). Efforts were continually made to address this and any suggestions of ways to encourage public participation would be welcomed.
- It was vital that consultation exercises remained accessible, which included providing the option to submit a paper response.
- Young people were important stakeholders. It was agreed that Councillors Keen and Brook would raise the consultation at their next visit to the Youth Council in order to encourage participation. It was also noted that the budget simulator tool would be shared with schools.
- The verbatim responses provided as part of the survey would be 'coded' and used to inform the final consultation report. The option of producing a 'you said, we did' type response could also



be explored.

- It was agreed that the proposal relating to budget scrutiny be endorsed and that officers work to secure the relevant meeting dates as soon as possible.

RESOLVED: That the proposals set out in the report in relation to budget scrutiny for 17/18 approved and implemented.

10. Waste Company Update

Members agreed to arrange an extraordinary meeting of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board in December 17 in order to consider the Companies' Business Plans, which would include an update in relation to the Waste Company.

RESOLVED: That an extraordinary meeting of the OSM be arranged for December 17 in order to consider the Companies' Business Plans.

11. OSM Referral to Cabinet – Response from the Mayor

The response from the Mayor was noted. The Board reiterated that they hoped they could meet the Mayor for an informal discussion (see Agenda Item no. 5 above) on 7th December 17 or soon after.

12. Standing Item: Task and Finish Group Reports

During consideration of the item the following comments were made;

- Potential new Task and Finish Group topics would be identified by the Party Leads following discussion with their groups. OSM would then be tasked with choosing those that went forward.
- Members acknowledged the difficulty in setting dates for some Task and Finish Group activities, particularly when timescales were short, and suggested that a Doodle Poll survey was the most efficient way to seek availability.
- It was noted that the libraries work that had recently concluded (see agenda item no. 8) was part one of a two stage process. The follow up task would be to consider how best to implement changes to the library service following the Cabinet decision in December 17.
- The Task and Finish activities in relation to Adult and Children's Social Care had taken sometime to define due to the very large remits of both areas, however, matters were progressing and both groups would shortly begin evidence gathering.



- It was noted that the Task and Finish Group update report would regularly be circulated to all Members to keep them informed of progress.

RESOLVED: That the updates be noted and that the Lead Members prepare a list of potential new Task and Finish topics for consideration at a future meeting.

13. Standing Item: Feedback on Scrutiny Structures and New Ways of Working

The Chair introduced the item, commenting that the pilot around scrutiny was working well in many areas but there were some aspects that would need to be refined as the process evolved and the Party Leads would be meeting regularly to consider arising issues. The Board went on to share their views, commenting as follows;

- Now that the first Task and Finish Group activity (on libraries) had concluded the part one of their work it could be useful to reflect on any lessons learnt.
- Consideration should be given to some of the reports that used to be regularly received by Scrutiny such as the Risk Registers and performance updates. It was noted that the Risk policy was being refreshed and would be considered at the Cabinet meeting on 7th November 17, with the Corporate Risk Register going to Audit Committee in November 17, and the directorate Risk Registers thereafter.
- Members agreed that it would be useful to access additional training and support to help develop skills in areas such as scrutiny and finance. It was noted that in-house training could and should be utilised where possible, but a Member Development Steering Group would also be meeting on 2nd November 17 to start to plan provision of any external support. It was agreed that officers would report back on the outcomes of the Steering Group at the OSM meeting on 7th December 17.

14. Standing Item: Scrutiny Work Programme

The update was noted.

15. Standing Item: OSMB Action Sheet

The update was noted.

16. Information Item: Mayor's Forward Plan

The update was noted.



17. Information Item: WECA Scrutiny Update

No updates were provided.

18. Information Item: Finance Update

The update was noted.

19. Information Item: Portfolio Leads

The update was noted.

20. Information Item: Dates of Forthcoming Meetings

The update was noted.

13. Date of next meeting.

The next meeting would take place at 5pm on 7th December 17.

The Meeting ended at 8:50pm

CHAIR _____

Appendix A – Flood Risk Strategy Presentation

