

Decision Pathway – Report Template



PURPOSE: Key decision

MEETING: Cabinet

DATE: 01 October 2019

TITLE	Structural Repairs to Temple Gate & West End MSCP		
Ward(s)	Central Ward		
Author:	Gary Lloyd	Job title:	Infrastructure Manager, Parking Services
Cabinet lead:	Cllr Dudd	Executive Director lead:	Colin Molton
Proposal origin: <i>BCC Staff</i>			
Decision maker: Cabinet Member			
Decision forum: <i>Cabinet</i>			
Purpose of Report:			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To brief Cabinet on options and costs for structural repairs and life care plans for Temple Gate and West End MSCPS to extend the useful life of the car parks for another 10 years. To provide details on the proposed changes to increase the number of public parking spaces in Temple Gate by relocating secure parking and installing a new pay on foot/pay and display system. To seek confirmation to spend the approved Corporate Capital allocation of £2m through prudential borrowing to undertake structural repairs and the refurbishment of the car parks. 			
Evidence Base:			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> The Temple Gate and West End car parks are now around 50 years old. They are not built to modern standards. Both car parks are showing signs of age and as with all reinforced concrete structures of this age require structural repairs and maintenance to extend their useful life. Temple Gate MSCP is a seven storey car park dating from 1970/71 located close to Temple Meads Railway Station. It is located within the Temple Quarter Enterprise Zone. The car park has always been linked with tenants in the adjacent Temple Gate House/City Point. Property Services are anticipating that the Temple Gate car park will have a useful life in plans for the Temple Quarter until 2030. The car park currently provides 47 public car parking spaces at ground level. The remaining parts of the car park (upper levels) provide 368 secure car parking spaces. Not all secure car parking spaces are occupied by tenants or season ticket holders. Vehicle and pedestrian access is controlled by electric gates that are opened by the use of plastic cards or number pad. Temple Gate generates approximately £220,000k income per year. West End MSCP is a seven storey car park dating from 1966 and is located in Berkeley Place in Clifton. West End generates approximately £1,024,000 per year. CH2M Jacobs were commissioned in 2017 to undertake structural condition surveys of the car parks and to make recommendations for prioritised remedial actions and draft life care plans that would provide the car parks to continue to have a useful life. (10 years for Temple Gate and 20 years for West End). CH2M/Jacobs were also commissioned to draft specifications for contract tendering and to ensure that any works on site comply with the Construction (Design and Management) Regulations 2015. CH2M /Jacobs submitted the reports in September 2018. The reports are attached as appendices. The main findings and recommendations of the Temple Gate Reports is summarised below: 			
Temple Gate MSCP			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> There are concerns around areas of failing blockwork on the south western elevation. These works cannot be undertaken until the Temple Circus works are complete as these works have necessitated the closure of the other entry / exit lanes to the car park from Temple Gate. 			

7. Vehicle restraint and pedestrian barriers between the decks of the car park require replacement to modern code standards.
8. The glazing systems in the stair/lift towers have extensively deteriorated and are in need of substantial repair and refurbishment.
9. Areas of the concrete decks and soffits have failed as a result of chloride induced corrosion that requires repair and enhanced corrosion protection.
10. It was recommended that additional testing was undertaken to look in greater details at areas of the car park to ascertain if additional strengthening works are require. (These additional tests have been undertaken).
11. CH2M / Jacobs put forward the following maintenance options:

Option A: Undertake essential maintenance only with a view to managing deterioration only, with a view to predicting the end of the car park's life in 10 years. This option includes substantial works to vehicle restraint barriers and pedestrian barriers, repair of masonry walls, refurbishment of staircase glazing systems. (Based on Estimated cost of repairs = **£353,000**.)

Option B: Undertake works in Option A, but with an elevated level of maintenance, including repairs to decks and soffits, with a view to being able to more confidently extend life beyond 10 years. With on-going maintenance works this should extend the useful life of the car park by 10 years. This option would also include repairs to decks, soffits, external elevations, and roof repairs, remodelling of the car park layout to relocate the secure parking area to provide additional public parking and install new pay and display/pay on foot system. Estimated costs of repairs = **£499,635**.

Option C: Undertake the above works and apply a new waterproof with a view to providing a further 20 years of useful life. This will require the application of water proof deck coatings to the decks. Estimated additional costs could be up to **£466,000**.

12. It should be noted that Parking Services have undertaken urgent health & safety work in Temple Gate. This has included urgent repairs to areas of spalling on decks and soffits, glazing to stairwells, roof membrane and areas of brickwork. (These works are currently being undertaken at a cost of £117,000 funded from revenue).
13. It is recommended that Option B is undertaken to provide the car park with a useful life of over 10 years, and change the layout of the car park. There is uncertainty over the long-term future of the car park and Temple Gate House and it may not be appropriate to spend additional funds to achieve a 20 year useful life.

West End MSCP

14. The main high and medium priority defects are:
15. Extensive spalling to the concrete decks and soffits, (especially on the lower levels). This has been caused primarily from chloride-induced corrosion. These will need to be repaired and have enhanced protection such as galvanic anodes or cathode protection systems.
16. The stair glazing system on the south western end of the building has extensively deteriorated and is in need of substantial repair and refurbishment.
17. The report also highlights the following:
18. Decks at Levels 1A, 2B and Level 2A are experiencing actively aggressive extensive corroding of steel reinforcement. These levels are the decks closest to the vehicle access points. This is difficult to treat in isolation. This may result in weak points in the structure between columns and the decks. Demolition is likely to be required of these decks to undertake repairs to provide a useful life over 10 years. The removal of the above decks and there replacement may cause structural issues elsewhere in the car park as the building "goes out of balance" and additional stresses may with extra stress/loading being placed on other areas of the car park . To achieve a further 10 year useful life and minimise corrosion repaired decks will need galvanic anodes or cathodic protection in combination with a high quality surface wearing course.
19. Corrosion in the higher decks could be treated with a rolling programme of concrete repairs over 5 to 10 years. Coating

the decks with an appropriate coating will prevent further chloride induced corrosion.

20. The vehicle restraint system provision in the car park does not provide adequate protection. It is recommended that the system is replaced with one that meets current standards and regulations.
21. CH2M / Jacobs put forward the following maintenance options:

Option A: undertake work to address existing health and safety risks associated with vehicle barriers and execute a comprehensive in situ repair strategy for deteriorating reinforced concrete decks. The concrete repair strategy is likely to provide the minimum requirement for an extension of functionality for 10 years. It will not prevent further deterioration. It should be noted that the extent of defects to Levels 1A, 2B and Level 2A will require an assessment to determine best method and size of the repairs. An assessment on how to undertake these repairs will be required as propping may be required.

Estimated costs = £592,000.

Option B: undertake the above with an enhanced repair strategy that includes high performance deck coatings. This will extend the life of the decks beyond the 10 year horizon to help minimise future deck deterioration and alleviate need for extensive repair in next 5 to 10 years.

Estimated costs = £1,062,000.

Option C: undertake the above but include extensive replacement of the existing decks on Levels 1A, 2B and Level 2A, rather than using repairs and coatings. This will provide a future life of these decks beyond 20 years. Deck replacement is major works and will require further assessment and design. This may be difficult to achieve without as built drawings.

Estimated costs = £1,575,000.

22. On balance it is considered Option B is undertaken to provide the car park with a useful life of over 10 years. Option C will require a difficult repair that includes partial demolition with new materials and construction methods being used on an old structure. There is a risk that costs could escalate if this Option C is pursued as there is the potential for other parts of the structure to be put at risk.
23. It must be emphasised that structural surveys are based on sample testing of areas of the car parks structure. There a risk with repairs to reinforced concrete structures that are 50 years plus old that further defects works will come to light once repairs have started and costs will rise. This was the case with the structural repairs undertaken at Trenchard St MSCP in 2012/13. It is therefore recommend that a contingency of 22% is added to the forecasted cost to mitigate against this risk. Therefore, if the recommended options are approved, the total forecasted spend for both car parks will be £2,000,000 (including contingency). The works will be funded through prudential borrowing with a financial charge of £234,000 funded from the Parking account.
24. In view of the possibility that the West End car park may not be a viable structure after the next 10 years, the Executive Director, Growth and Regeneration will be commissioning an appraisal of possible future redevelopment options for the West End car park site.

Cabinet Member / Officer Recommendations:

That Cabinet

1. Approve option B as set out in the report for Temple Gate MSCP to undertake internal and external concrete repairs, roof repairs to extend the useful life of the car park for 10 years requiring a commitment of £499,635 from the Capital allocation.
2. Approve option B as set out in the report for West End MSCP to undertake extensive concrete repairs to prevent further deterioration of the structure to extend the useful life of the car park for 10 years requiring a commitment of £1,062,000 from Capital allocation.
3. Authorise the Executive Director Growth and Regeneration to procure all necessary contracts for implementation of Recommendations 1 and 2.

Corporate Strategy alignment:

1. Better Lives Programme: Maintain public services with people at the heart of what we do and make cost savings whilst holding our ambition to improve outcomes.

City Benefits:

1. The MSCPs support the City's economy, the City's Transport Strategy and the Joint Local Transport Plan 2011 – 2026.

Background Documents:

- Temple Gate MSCP Life Care Plan – April 2018
- West End MSCP Life Care Plan – May 2018

Revenue Cost	£234,000	Source of Revenue Funding	Parking account
Capital Cost	£2,000,000	Source of Capital Funding	Prudential borrowing
One off cost <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Ongoing cost <input type="checkbox"/>	Saving Proposal <input type="checkbox"/>	Income generation proposal <input type="checkbox"/>

Required information to be completed by Financial/Legal/ICT/ HR partners:

1. Finance Advice: The Temple Gate and West End car parks are now around 50 years old. Both car parks are showing signs of age and are in need of structural repairs and maintenance to extend their useful life. The R&M is expected to extend the assets life by a further 10 years.

Both Carparks generated a combined net revenue expenditure contribution of £950k in 2018/19 (which amongst other things goes towards funding our sustainable transport team/programme).

The report outlines 3 options to address the much needed R&M, with costs ranging from £945,000 - £2,041,000. The recommended Option B for both the Temple Gate & West End car parks at a cost of c£2m including contingencies. Table 1 below summaries the costs of each option (details of what is covered can be found in the body of this report):

Car Park	Temple Gate	West End	Total
	£'000	£'000	£'000
Options:			
A	£353	£592	£945
B	£500	£1,062	£1,562
C	£466	£1,575	£2,041

There will be a financial charge for the prudential borrowing (c£234k) and this will be funded from the parking account.

Cabinet approved £2m prudential borrowing (over 2 years) at its January 2019 cabinet to fund this work. The report is seeking the approval to utilise such funds for the required work.

It is worth noting that due to the current conditions, £117k has already been spent from the parking revenue account to address some immediate health & safety issues.

Finance Business Partner: Kayode Olagundoye, Interim Finance Business Partner, Growth and Regeneration, 16/08/19

2. Legal Advice: Procurement of the necessary contracts (services and works) for the work required at both car parks will need to comply with the provisions of the Public Contracts Regulations 2015 (where appropriate) and the Council's own procurement rules.

Legal Team Leader: Eric Andrews, Team Leader, Legal Services. 18th July 2019.

3. Implications on IT: As a building structural repair initiative, there are no IT implications in this report. As part of the refurbishment, there may be improvements/changes to the CCTV and payment mechanisms, but these will no doubt be addressed at the appropriate time and through the appropriate channels.

IT Team Leader: Ian Gale, ICT Service Manager, Service Delivery and Integration. 23rd June 2019

4. HR Advice: No HR implications are evident.

HR Partner: Chris Hather, HR Advisor, HR and Workforce. 25th June 2019

EDM Sign-off	Colin Molton	26 th June 2019
Cabinet Member sign-off	Cllr Dudd	18 th July 2019
For Key Decisions - Mayor's	Mayor's Office	3 rd September 2019

Office sign-off		
------------------------	--	--

Appendix A – Further essential background / detail on the proposal	YES
Appendix B – Details of consultation carried out - internal and external	NO
Appendix C – Summary of any engagement with scrutiny	NO
Appendix D – Risk assessment	NO
Appendix E – Equalities screening / impact assessment of proposal	YES
Appendix F – Eco-impact screening/ impact assessment of proposal	YES
Appendix G – Financial Advice	NO
Appendix H – Legal Advice	NO
Appendix I – Exempt Information	NO
Appendix J – HR advice	NO
Appendix K – ICT	NO